DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 443 049 CG 030 122

AUTHOR Portman, Tarrell Awe Agahe
TITLE Inclusion of Qualitative Research: Content Analysis of ACA Journals.
PUB DATE 2000-03-00
NOTE 13p.; Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the American Counseling Association (Washington, D.C., March 20-25, 2000).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research (143) -- Speeches/Meeting Papers (150)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Content Analysis; Counseling; Journal Articles; *Qualitative Research; *Scholarly Journals
IDENTIFIERS *American Counseling Association

ABSTRACT

This paper provides descriptive statistics related to published articles which utilized qualitative methodologies in research studies, as well as conceptual articles pertaining to qualitative research methodologies. The articles examined covered the years 1967-1999. During the 32-year time period, 15 qualitative research articles were published. The greater percentage of these articles were published in volume 77 of the "Journal of Counseling and Development" (JCD) in 1999. These articles had multiple authors for the most part. All 15 articles were submitted by authors who were from different educational institutions. There was no repetition of authors or institutions within this group. There were 5 articles published that utilized mixed methodologies. These articles primarily focused on quantitative data in the study and utilized qualitative data as support for the quantitative data. The sample size for the qualitative research studies ranged from single case studies to a large group study in the mixed studies. The mean sample size including the large group was 44.5. Excluding the large group, the mean sample size was 28.4. Conceptual articles in JCD have embraced the use of qualitative research with specific counseling issues or populations. Using qualitative procedures in assessment has been discussed and rebutted in the JCD. (Contains 4 tables and 34 references.) (MKA)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 443 049

Running head: CONTENT ANALYSIS OF QUALITATIVE ARTICLES IN ACA JOURNALS

SCOPE OF INTEREST NOTICE
The ERIC Facility has assigned this document for processing to:
CG
In our judgment, this document is also of interest to the Clearinghouses noted to the right. Indexing should reflect their special points of view.
TM

Inclusion of Qualitative Research: Content Analysis of ACA Journals

Paper presented to the ACES Research Promotion Focus Group at the

2000 American Counseling Association World Conference, in Washington, D.C.

Tarrell Awe Agahe Portman

The University of Iowa

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
T. Portman
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

CG 30122

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Abstract

The Association for Counselor Education and Supervision Research Promotion Focus Group met at the 1999 World Conference in San Diego, California. One of the goals established for the 1999-2000 term was to work toward balanced recognition for qualitative and quantitative studies in the counseling field. In the discussion of this goal, focus group members raised a question concerning the publication of qualitative research studies within the various division journals of the American Counseling Association. This paper provides descriptive statistics related to articles published which utilized qualitative methodologies in research studies, as well as, conceptual articles pertaining to qualitative research methodologies. The articles were examined by conducting a content analysis of the Journal of Counseling and Development (1967-1999), Counselor Education and Supervision, the Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development, The Journal for Specialists in Group Work, The Journal of Humanistic Counseling, Education and Development, Journal of College Counseling, the Adultspan Journal, and Counseling and Values.

Inclusion of Qualitative Research: Content Analysis of ACA Journals

In recent years, professionals in the field of counseling are increasing discussions related to research methodologies. One of the most prominent discussions includes topics pertaining to the use of qualitative research methodologies (Borders & Larrabee, 1993; Hanna & Shank, 1995; Hosmand, 1989; Neimeyer & Resnikoff, 1982; Osborne, 1990). How are qualitative methods considered by researchers? If I chose to call myself a qualitative researcher, will people assume I am unable to conduct quantitative research studies? If I conduct a research study using qualitative methodologies will I be able to publish the gained knowledge in my professional journals? All of these questions may arise among professionals involved with qualitative research. But the most persuasive argument against using qualitative research methodologies may be the fear of not being able to get the results published.

Questions need to be answered by establishing a baseline concerning where qualitative research stands in the dissemination of ideas and knowledge in professional publications. This paper presents the results of a content analysis on the primary and secondary journals of the American Counseling Association. A frequency analysis was conducted on the Journal of Counseling & Development (1967-1999), Counselor Education and Supervision, and The Journal for Specialists in Group Work. All journals were searched using the electronic database PsychINFO, 1967 to the present.

The Journal of Counseling and Development (JCD) and the Personnel and Guidance Journal have undergone thorough content analyses in the past (Barry & Wolf, 1958; Pelsma & Cesari, 1989; Stone & Shertzer, 1964; Weinrach, Lustig, Chan, and Thomas, 1998; Williams & Buboltz, 1999). The majority of these analyses concentrated on similar classification systems. However, attention was given to authorship and institutional affiliation of the contributing

authors. An interesting pattern emerges when examining the previous content analysis. There is no mention of qualitative research studies or comparisons between quantitative or qualitative research submissions. It appears the counseling profession has yet to approach this topic when analyzing the major framework where knowledge is disseminated to professionals in the field.

Method

The content analysis for the inclusion of articles which used qualitative research methods in the Journal of Counseling and Development (or The Personnel and Guidance Journal) included an analysis period from 1967 through 1999. The journals were reviewed using electronic databases. Each article was examined to determine whether it fit into three categories: 1) qualitative research study; 2) conceptual article promoting qualitative research; and 3) unrelated to qualitative research. Key search words were qualitative and the name of the journal being examined.

Results

During this 32 year time period, 15 qualitative research articles were published. The greater percentage of these articles (n = 4 or 33%) being published in the volume 77 of the JCD published in 1999. These articles had multiple authors for the most part. All 15 articles were submitted by authors who were from different educational institutions. There was no repetition of authors or institutions within this group. There were 5 articles published which utilized mixed methodologies. These articles primarily focused on quantitative data in the study and utilized qualitative data as support for the quantitative data. The sample size for the qualitative research studies ranged from single case studies (n = 1) to a large group study (n = 189) in the mixed studies. The mean for the sample size including the large group was 44.5. Excluding the large

group the mean sample size for the qualitative studies was 28.4. The 10 qualitative research articles are listed in Table 1 and the 5 mixed qualitative/quantitative studies are listed in Table 2.

Table 1. Qualitative Research Articles published in the Journal of Counseling and Development from 1967 through 1999 by Author and Institutional Affiliation.

Journal Date	Vol. #	Author	Institutional Affiliation	Sample Size
1985 (review this article more closely)	63(9)	Jack Martin	University of Western Ontario	1+
1987	65(5)	P.V. Murrary, J. E. Levitov, L. Castenell, & J. H. Joubert	Loyola University	16
1995	73(6)	B. Ogilvie & J. Daniluk	Vancouver School Board	3
1997	75(4)	L. Wilcox-Matthew, A. Ottens, and C. W. Minor	Scott Community College	19
1998	76(1)	D. M. Lawson, A. L. McClain, S. Matlock-Hertzel, M. Duffy, and R. Urbanovski	Texas A & M University, College Station	12
1999	77(1)	Ann Shanks-Glauser	University of Georgia	17
1999	77(2)	Barbara Morgan and Pamela McMillan	College of William and Mary	7
1999	77(2)	Alan M. Schwitzer, Oris T. Griffin, Julie R. Ancis, and Celeste R. Thomas	Old Dominion University	22
1999	77(4)	R. M. Davison Aviles, M. P. Guerrero, H. Barajas Howarth and G. Thomas	Bradley University	72

Table 2: Mixed studies which utilized qualitative methods.

1995 (mixed methods)	73(4)	J. M. Littrell, J.A. Malia, & M. Vanderwood	Iowa State University	61
1995 (mixed methods0	73(3)	Luzzo, D. A.	Johnson County Community College	401
1995 (mixed methods)	73(6)	M. J. Heppner, G. E. Good, T. L. Hillenbrand-Gunn, and A. K. Hawkins	University of Missouri	257
1996 (mixed methods)	74(6)	R. M. Orndorff and E. L. Herr	Moravian College	189
1997 (mixed methods)	75(3)	L. Crutchfield, and D. Borders	Columbus State University	29

Table 3. Qualitative Research Articles published in the Counselor Education & Supervision journal from 1967 through 1999 by Author and Institutional Affiliation.

Journal Date	Vol. #	Author	Institutional Affiliation
1998	37(4)	Seem, S.R. & Johnson, E.	State University of New York, College at Brockport
1997	36(4)	Swickert, M. L.	Central Michigan University
1995 (mixed study)	34(4)	Good, G. E., & Heppner, M. J.	University of Missouri, Columbia
1972 (mixed study)	11(3)	Guttman, M. A., & Haase, R. F.	McGill University, Montreal

Table 4: Qualitative Research Articles published in the Journal of Specialist in Group Work from 1967 through 1999 by Author and Institutional Affiliation.

Journal Date	Vol. #	Author	Institutional Affiliation
1998	23(3)	Conyne, R.K.	University of Cincinnati
1997	22(3)	Kline, W.B., Falbaum, D. F., Pope, V.T., Hargraves, G.A., & Hundley, S.F.	Idaho State University
1987	12(3)	Bednar, R. L., Corey, G., Evans, N.J., & Gazda, G. M.	Brigham Young University

Conceptual articles in the JCD have embraced the use of qualitative research with specific counseling issues or populations. Cramer (1986) was one of the first authors to discuss a qualitative perspective as a practical implication for working with Gay parents and their children. Using qualitative procedures in assessment has been discussed and rebutted in the JCD (Drum, 1992; Goldman, 1992). Hanna and Shank (1995) pointed out the limitations of using only quantitative data for all counseling research situations. Merchant and Dupuy (1996) suggested multicultural counseling competencies should be viewed using qualitative research lenses.

Discussion

A major assumption within the counseling profession is that our professional journals serve the purpose of promoting and disseminated current research and knowledge to professionals in the counseling field. Embracing this assumption could also mean as professionals we have information and knowledge published in these journals which are deemed

appropriate and relevant. It is the professions journals which provide an historical perspective of relevant issues facing the counseling profession (Weinrach, 1987).

In fairness, the research section of the JCD did not appear as a regular feature until 1990 (Williams & Buboltz, 1999). Since that time journal editors have included qualitative research study articles in the JCD. The sparsity of qualitative research publications in our professional journals needs to be explored further to determine why the actual numbers are so low.

References

Barry, R., & Wolf, B. (1958). Five years of The Personnel and Guidance Journal. The Personnel and Guidance Journal, 36, 549-556.

Bednar, R. L., Corey, G., Evans, N.J., & Gazda, G. M. (1987). Overcoming obstacles to the future development of research on group work. Journal for Specialists in Group Work, 12, 98-111.

Border, L.D., & Larabee, M. J. (1993). A research perspective for the Journal of Counseling & Development. Journal of Counseling & Development, 72, 5-6.

Conyne, R. K. (1998). Personal experience and meaning in group work leadership: The views of the experts. Journal for Specialists in Group Work, 23, 245-256.

Cramer, D. (1986). Gay parents and their children: A review of research and practical implications. Journal of Counseling & Development, 64, 504-507.

Crutchfield, L. B., & Borders, D. (1997). Impact of two clinical peer supervision models on practicing school counselors. Journal of Counseling & Development, 75, 219-230.

Davison Aviles, R. M., Guerrero, M.P., Barajas Howarth, H., & Thomas, G. (1999). Perceptions of Chicano/Latino students who have dropped out of school. Journal of Counseling & Development, 77, 465-473.

Drum, D.J.(1992). A review of Leo Goldman's article "Qualitative assessment: An approach for counselors." Journal of Counseling & Development, 70, 622-623.

Glauser, A. S. (1999). Legacies of racism. Journal of Counseling & Development, 77, 62-67.

Goldman, L. (1992). Qualitative assessment: An approach for counselors. Journal of Counseling & Development, 70, 616-621.

Good, G. E., & Heppner, M. J. (1995). Students' perceptions of a gender issues course: A qualitative and quantitative examination. Counselor Education and Supervision, 34, 308-320.

Guttman, M.A. & Haase, R. F. (1972). Effect of experimentally induced sets of high and low "expertness" during brief vocational counseling. Counselor Education and Supervision, 11, 171-178.

Hanna, F. J. & Shank, G. (1995). The specter of metaphysics in counseling research and practice: The qualitative challenge. Journal of Counseling & Development, 74, 53-59.

Heppner, M.J., Good, G.E., Hillenbrand-Gunn, T. L., Hawkins, A. K., Hacquard, L.L., Nichols, R. K., DeBord, K.A., & Brock, K.J. (1995). Examining sex differences in altering attitudes about rape: A test of the elaboration likelihood model. Journal of Counseling & Development, 73, 640-647.

Hosmand, L.T.(1989). Alternate research paradigms: A review and teaching proposal. The Counseling Psychologist, 17, 3-79.

Kline, W.B., Falbaum, D. F., Pope, V.T., Hargraves, G.A., & Hundley, S.F. (1997). The significance of the group experience for students in counselor education: A preliminary naturalistic inquiry. Journal for Specialists in Group Work, 22, 157-166.

Lawson, D.M., McClain, A. L., Matlock-Hetzel, S., Duffy, M., & Urbanovski, R. (1997). School families: Implementation and evaluation of a middle school prevention program. Journal of Counseling & Development, 76,82-89.

Littrell, J.M., Malia, J.A., & Vanderwood, M. (1995). Single-session brief counseling in a high school. Journal of Counseling & Development, 73, 451-458.

Luzzo, D. A. (1995). Gender differences in college students'career maturity and perceived barriers in career development. Journal of Counseling & Development, 73, 319-322.

Martin, J. (1985). Measuring clients' cognitive competence in research on counseling. Journal of Counseling & Development, 63(9), 556-560.

Merchant, N., & Dupuy, P. (1996). Multicultural counseling and qualitative research: Shared worldview and skills. Journal of Counseling & Development, 74, 537-541.

Morgan, B., & MacMillan, P. (1999). Helping clients move toward constructive change: A three-phase integrated counseling model. Journal of Counseling & Development, 77, 153-159.

Murray, P.V., Levitov, J.E., Castenell, L., & Joubert, J.H. (1987). Qualitative evaluation models applied to a high school counseling center. Journal of Counseling & Development, 65, 259-261.

Neimeyer, G., & Renikoff, A. (1982). Qualitative strategies in counseling research. The Counseling Psychologist, 10, 75-93.

Ogilvie, B., & Daniluk, J. (1996). Common themes in the experiences of mother/daughter incest survivors: Implications for counseling. Journal of Counseling & Development, 73, 598-602.

Osborne, J.W. (1990). Some basic existential-phenomenological research methodology for counselors. Canadian Journal of Counselling, 24, 79-21.

Orndorff. R. M., & Herr, E.L. (1996). A comparative study of declared and undeclared college students on career uncertainty and involvement in career development activities. Journal of Counseling & Development, 74, 632-639.

Pelsma, D.M, & Cesari, J.P. (1989). Content analysis of the Journal of Counseling & Development: Volumes 48-66. Journal of Counseling & Development, 67, 275-278.

Seem, S.R., & Johnson, E. (1998). Gender bias among counseling trainees: A study of case conceptualization. Counselor Education and Supervision, 37, 257-268.

Schwitzer, A. M., Griffin, O.T., Ancis, J. R., & Thomas, C. R. (1999). Social adjustment experiences of African American college students. Journal of Counseling & Development, 77, 189-197.

Swickert, M.L. (1997). Perceptions regarding the professional identity of counselor education doctoral graduates in private practice: A qualitative study. Counselor Education and Supervision, 36, 332-340.

Weinrach, S. G.(1987). Some serious and some not so serious reactions to AACD and its journals. Journal of Counseling & Development, 65, 395-399.

Weinrach, S.G., Loustig, D., Chan, F., & Thomas, K.R. (1998). Publication patterns of The Personnel and Guidance Journal/Journal of Counseling & Development: 1978 to 1993. Journal of Counseling & Development, 76, 427-435.

Wilcox-Matthew, L., Ottens, A., & Minor, C.W. (1997). An analysis of significant events in counseling. Journal of Counseling & Development, 75, 282-291.